***Final***

**Final Evaluation Report (FER)of the First South West Indian Ocean Fisheries Governance and Shared Growth Project (SWIOFish1)**

The first South West Indian Ocean Fisheries Governance and Shared Growth Project is expected to end of September 2021. As such, a Final Evaluation Report is to be prepared by the IOC to assess project impact and the degree of success on achieving project objectives. The project is seeking a consultant who will assess the results and impacts of the project in respect of their relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impacts at regional level under the SWIOFC’s Umbrella. The final evaluation will also review project management and procedures. The final evaluation wil be based on the input, process, output, outcome and impact tracking indicators, which have been developed within the results framework of project.

**Project Background**

Given the important achievements of the South West Indian Ocean Fisheries Project, (SWIOFP), the member countries of the SWIOFC have requested support from World Bank for a follow-on operation, which would continue to support regional integration around fisheries management, while expanding the approach beyond research to strengthen sector governance and promote shared growth through harnessing the value of coastal and marine fisheries to regional economies.

The First Southwest Indian Ocean Fisheries governance and Shared Growth Project (SWIOFish1) Global Environmental Facility Grant agreement between the Indian Ocean Commission (on behalf of the participating countries) and the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (on behalf of GEF) was signed on May 8, 2015 and became effective on December 18, 2015. The project ran for six years, with a closing date in the grant agreement specified as September 30, 2021.

The Project is part of a Series of Projects, under the SWIOFish Program, with the overarching objective of increasing the economic, social, and environmental benefits to SWIO countries from sustainable marine fisheries. The following countries are participating in the SWIOFish1 project: Comoros, France (by virtue of its outermost regions- Reunion in the region), Kenya, Madagascar, Maldives, Mauritius, Mozambique, Seychelles, Somalia, South Africa, Tanzania and Yemen. All these countries are party to the South West Indian Ocean Fisheries Commission (SWIOFC).

**Project Development and Global Objective**

The Project Development Objective is to improve the management effectiveness of selected priority fisheries at regional, national and community level.

**Specific Objectives**

The specific objectives of the first project (SWIOFish1) is to improve the management effectiveness of selected priority fisheries at regional, national and community level, through consolidating and strengthening regional cooperation on fisheries and marine resource management among the country members of the SWIOFC and strengthening the capacity for fisheries’ economic governance.

**Project Beneficiaries**

The main Project beneficiaries are the SWIOFC Secretariat, the SWIOFC Members and by extension the coastal fishing communities of the SWIO region and in the island countries where fish is a vital component of a food security basket.

Regional and national institutions in the fisheries sector and associated with the project benefit from improved capacity to formulate and analyze policy and to promote coordination as a result of project-financed institutional development activities.

**Final Evaluation Report**

The FER intends to:

a) Provide a complete reportof the performance and results of the operation at the level of SWIOFC and its impact on the Member States and analysis of project performance against the results indicators (PDO and Intermediate indicators);

(b) Capture and disseminate experience with regard to (i) improve the selection of future interventions to achieve goals; (ii) improve the design and implementation of future interventions through lessons learned; and (iii) help ensure greater development impact and sustainability of operations;

(c) Provide accountability and transparency at the level of the operation with regard to the Recipient/Borrower and the Key Project bodies such as the SWIOFC, the SWIOFC bureau, the SWIOFish1 Steering Committee and involved stakeholders;

The Recipient/Borrower as per the Financing Agreement between the International Development Association (the "Association") and Indian Ocean Commission (the "Recipient") for the SWIOFish1 Project being financially managed by IOC on behalf of the SWIOFC beneficiary countries, Comoros, Reunion (France), Kenya, Madagascar, Maldives, Mauritius, Mozambique, Seychelles, South Africa, Somalia , Tanzania and Yemen.

(d) the completion/final report should include:

(i) Assessment of the **objective, strategy, implementation, and operational experience**;

(ii) Assessment of the **outcome** of the project against the approved objectives;

(iii) **Assisting the preparation of the Bank’s ICR**.

The report should also **provide information** to the Bank on the economic, financial, social, institutional, and environmental conditions in which the operation was implemented, and on implementation and operation results (according to the timing specified in the result framework along with the project indicators). This typically entails: (i) **Providing feedback** on the quality of the Bank's contribution, from identification to supervision; and (ii) **Furnishing pertinent elements for discussions** among the Bank, the recipient, the implementing agency, beneficiary countries and other partners.

1. **SCOPE OF STUDY**

Three main elements to be evaluated are Delivery, Implementation and Finances. Each component will be evaluated using three criteria: effectiveness, efficiency and timeliness.

The analysis will focus on key factors affecting implementation and outcomes; assessment of Bank and Beneficiaries performance and lessons learnt; with supporting elements annexed when relevant. A suggested template for the main text and annexes is provided in Annex I. The consultant may discuss the template with the client. Although there might be slight difference between the scope and suggested template it should be considered as mutual inclusive.

Among others, and not limited to, the following elements will need to be appraised:

1. **Institutional arrangement**

* Preparatory work and implementation strategies
* Consultative processes
* Technical support
* Capacity building initiatives
* Project outputs
* Assumptions and risks
* Project related complementary activities

1. **Outcome, results and impacts under the two components**

***Component 1:***

1. Enhancing the capacity for management of priority regional fisheries and challenges in the **SWIO,** in particular:
   1. collaboration in the management of regional fisheries and challenges, including:
      1. developing a regional strategy to increase national and regional benefits from priority regional fisheries, collaborating on transboundary living marine resources, and addressing shared challenges; (ii) preparing and implementing core regional work plan; and (iii) developing common regional minimum terms and conditions of access to tuna fisheries.
   2. Improving regional monitoring control and surveillance, including:
      1. establishing and upgrading regional fisheries monitoring, control and surveillance capability; and (ii) assisting certain SWIOFC Member Countries' efforts to update relevant maritime boundaries and fisheries legislation in conformity with international standards.
2. Enhancing regional coordination and collaboration, including:
   1. Developing and consolidating sustainable institutional arrangements to facilitate regional fisheries collaboration, and establishing sustainable regional fisheries institutions, including: (i) facilitating SWIOFC sessions, Regional Steering Committee meetings, and inter-session SWIOFC bureau meetings; (ii) preparing a consolidated annual SWIOFC work program; (iii) developing the capacity of SWIOFC to manage regional fisheries challenges; (iv) developing an effective and sustainable regional financing mechanism for SWIOFC work program; and (v) preparing common policy positions for engagement in regional and international fora.
   2. Strengthening regional knowledge management of priority fisheries and capacity development in technical and scientific services.

***Component 2:***

1. ***Project Management***
2. Strengthening the capacity of the Regional Project Implementation Unit, and Finance and Procurement Unit for implementation, management, monitoring and evaluation, fiduciary (procurement and financial) management, environmental and social safeguards management, and coordination of Part A of the Project.
3. Progress in the achievement of the immediate objectives (include level of indicator achievement where available)
4. ***Partnerships***
5. Assessment of local partnerships and involvement of stakeholders
6. Assessment of collaboration between government, intergovernmental and non-governmental organisations
7. ***Risk management***
8. Were problems/constraints, which impacted on successful delivery of the project identified at the project design stage and subsequently as part of the Mid Term Evaluation (MTE)?
9. Were there new threats/risks to project success that emerged during project implementation?
10. Were both kinds of risk appropriately dealt with?
11. Were recommendations arising from the MTR addressed?
12. ***Monitoring and Evaluation***
13. Assess the extent, appropriateness and effectiveness of adaptive management at all levels of the project implementation
14. Has there been a monitoring and evaluation framework for the project and how was this developed?
15. Is the reporting framework effective/appropriate?
16. Is this framework suitable for replication/continuation for any future project support?
17. ***Project Implementation***
18. Review the project management and implementation arrangements at all levels, in order to provide an opinion on its efficiency and cost effectiveness. This includes:
19. Processes and administration:
20. Milestones
21. Key decisions and outputs.
22. Project oversight and active engagement by: World Bank and Project steering committee and SWIOFC.
23. Project implementation: IOC- SWIOFC/SWIOFish1 Steering Committee and SWIOFC
24. ***Project Finances***

How well and cost effectively have financial arrangements of the project worked? This section will focus on the following three priority areas:

1. Project disbursements
   * Provide an overview of actual spending against budget expectations
   * Critically analyze disbursements to determine if funds have been applied effectively and efficiently.
2. Budget procedures

* Did the Project Document provide adequate guidance on how to allocate the budget?
* Review of audits and any issues raised in audits and subsequent adjustments to accommodate audit recommendations;
* Review the changes to fund allocations as a result of budget revisions and provide an opinion on the appropriateness and relevancy of such revisions

1. ***Lessons Learnt***

Review any lessons learnt

1. ***Assessment of Sustainability of project outcomes***

The sustainability assessment will give special attention to analysis of the risks that are likely to affect the persistence of project outcomes. The sustainability assessment should also explain how other important contextual factors that are not outcomes of the project will affect sustainability. Following three dimensions or aspects of sustainability will be addressed:

* Financial resources: Are there any financial risks involved in sustaining the project outcomes? What is the likelihood that financial and economic resources will not be available once the IDA Grant ends? (trends that may indicate that it is likely that in future there will be adequate financial resources for sustaining project’s outcomes once the SWIOFC Financing Mechanism is set up for eventual topping up by International donors)?
* Sociopolitical: Are there any social or political risks that can undermine the longevity of project outcomes? What is the risk that the level of SWIOFC Member State ownership will be insufficient to allow for the project outcomes/benefits to be sustained? Do the SWIOFC Member States see that it is in their interest that the project benefits continue to flow?
* Institutional framework and governance: Do the legal frameworks, policies and governance structures and processes in place in the SWIOFC Member States pose any threat to the continuation of project benefits? While assessing on this parameter also consider if the required systems for accountability and transparency, and the required technical know-how is in place.

Project outcomes will be rated as follows.

* Likely (L): There are no risks affecting this dimension of sustainability.
* Moderately Likely (ML). There are moderate risks that affect this dimension of sustainability.
* Moderately Unlikely (MU): There are significant risks that affect this dimension of sustainability
* Unlikely (U): There are severe risks that affect this dimension of sustainability.

Project monitoring and evaluation system will be rated as follows on each of the dimensions:

* Highly Satisfactory (HS): There were no shortcomings in the project M&E system.
* Satisfactory (S): There were minor shortcomings in the project M&E system.
* Moderately Satisfactory (MS): There were moderate shortcomings in the project M&E system
* Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): There were significant shortcomings in the project M&E system
* Unsatisfactory (U): There were major shortcomings in the project M&E system
* Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): The Project had no M&E system. “M&E plan implementation” will be considered a critical parameter for the overall assessment of the M&E system. The overall rating for the M&E systems will not be higher than the rating on “M&E plan implementation”

However, note that the project did not develop a specific M&E Framework. The Consultant will hence review the M&E System based on the reporting systems in place at the level of IOC, supervision missions by the Bank, the mid-term review and project implementation reports**.**

1. **METHODOLOGY OF EVALUATION APPROACH**

The completion/final report will be conducted in a participatory manner through a combination of processes. It is anticipated that the methodology to be used for the FER will include the following:

1. **Review of documentation including but not limited to:**

* Project Document and Project Appraisal Document;
* Project implementation reports
* Quarterly progress reports and work plans of the various implementation task teams;
* Audit reports;
* Mid Term Evaluation report;
* Project Implementation Manual
* Financial and Administration guidelines.

1. Visit to the SWIOFC secretariat to interact with the Ag Secretary and Technical Secretary, besides virtual interactions with the SWIOFC Bureau in Maputo and IOC Secretariat in Mauritius. If permissible a project country beneficiary could be visited. However, this highly dependent on Covid 19, otherwise this process will be undertaken remotely.
2. Online approaches should be used as much as possible to assess project in all of the beneficiary countries.
3. **SUGGESTED TEMPLATE OF THE DOCUMENT**
4. **Project Context, Development Objectives and Design** (this section is descriptive, taken from other documents, e.g., PAD, not evaluative):

* *Context at Appraisal (brief summary of SWIOFC Member States and sector background, rationale for Bank assistance)*
* *Project Development Objectives (PDO)*
* *Main Beneficiaries (briefly describe the “the primary target group” identified in the PAD and as captured in the PDO, as well as any other individuals and organizations expected to benefit from the project)*
* *Project Components*

1. **Key Factors Affecting Implementation and Outcomes**

* *Project Preparation with the collaboration of SWIOFC Secretariat*
* *Implementation Stage (including any project changes/restructuring, mid-term review, Project at Risk status, and actions taken, as applicable):*
* *Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Design, Implementation and Utilization:*
* *Safeguard and Fiduciary Compliance (focusing on issues and their resolution, as applicable)*

1. **Outcomes**

* *Relevance of Objectives,*
* *Achievement of Project Development Objectives (including brief discussion of causal linkages between outputs and outcomes, with details on outputs in Annex 4)*
* *Justification of Overall Outcome Rating (combining relevance, achievement of PDOs, and efficiency)*
* *Gender Aspects, and Social Development*

1. **Assessment of Bank and Recipient/Borrower Performance** (relating to design, implementation and outcome issues)
2. **Bank**

* *Quality of Supervision* (including of fiduciary and safeguards policies)
* *Justification of Rating for Overall Bank Performance*

1. **Recipient**

* *IOC Performance (Mauritius)*
* *Implementing Agency (SWIOFC and IOC)*
* *Regional Management Unit and Steering Committee*
* *Justification of Rating for Overall Borrower Performance*

1. **Lessons Learned**

**Comments on Issues Raised by Borrower/Implementing Agencies/Regional Management Unit/Other Beneficiary Countries/Partners**

* *Recipient/implementing agency*
* *Co financiers -IOC Smart fish*
* *Other partners and stakeholders* (e.g. NGOs- WWF)

1. **ANNEXES**

**Annex 1. Results Framework Analysis**

1. **Project Development Objective (from Project Appraisal Document)**
2. **PDO Indicator(s) ─ from Project Appraisal Document:** Baseline value, original target values, revised target values and actual values achieved at Completion or Target Date. Date achieved and comments (including % achieved).
3. **Intermediate Outcome Indicator(s) - from Project Appraisal Document:** Baseline value, original target values, revised target values and actual values achieved at Completion or Target Date. Date achieved and comments (including % achieved).

**Annex 3. Project Costs and Financing**

**(a)Project Cost by Component** (in US$ million equivalent): appraisal estimate, Actual / latest Estimate; Projection.

**(b) Co-financing:** source of funds, type of financing, appraisal estimated (US$ million equivalent); Actual/Latest estimate; Projection

**(c) Disbursement Profile**

**Annex 4. Outputs by Component**

**Annex 5.** **Comments on FER by Beneficiary Countries**

**Annex6. Comments of Co-financiers and Other Partners/Stakeholders**

**Annex 7. List of Supporting Documents**

**Annex B –Client’s Staff.**

The staff to be provided by xxxxxx to complete the FER will be Mr. yyyyyy

**Annex C – Reporting**

The FER evaluator will be expected to produce:

1. **A concise evaluation report focusing on effectiveness issues and their resolution**, factors affecting performance, and the results and outcomes of interventions in the context of objectives. The main text should normally not exceed 30 pages, while annexes provide the essential background on operational design, implementation, outcomes, and performance issues.
2. **A Power Point Presentation** (circa 15-20 slides) covering the key points of the FER to be presented at the final meeting of the Project in early June 2021 (TBD).

The report, together with annexes, shall be written in English and shall be presented in electronic form in MS Word format.

The report production schedule includes:

* Start Date: 1st March 2021
* Inception Report March 2021
* Interim Report – June 2021
* Draft FER – July 2021.
* Presentation to the SWIOFish1 RPSC Meeting and take onboard final comments on the FER
* Submit Final FER report– End August 2021

**Annex D: Consultant Qualifications**

**Education**

•Master’s degree in Marine related Sciences and /or Natural Resource Management or equivalent to the assignment

**Experience**

The Consultant must have the following qualifications:

•              Relevant experience with evaluation methodologies

•              Experience in applying SMART indicators and reconstructing or validating baseline scenarios

•              Experience in project design and evaluating of projects

•              Minimum 10 years of relevant professional experience and has the technical knowledge in the targeted focal area(s)

•              Knowledge of World Bank evaluation process

•              Experience working in East African countries and Indian Ocean island states and has a good understanding of the fisheries management and governance structures in the Indian Ocean

•              Experience working with communities, government sectors, NGOs and has excellent communication skills;

•              Experience in the policy development processes associated with marine and coastal development issues

•              World Bank Project management experience, at least one project.

**Language Requirements**:

* Fluency in written and spoken English is essential

Duration : 40 working days within a period of 6 months (March 2021 – August 2021)

Annex 1: Project Results Indicators

